

Appendix 28 – Option Assessment of Scheduling and Un-scheduling of Taylors Mistake, Hobsons Bay and Boulder Bay Baches

Option Assessment for scheduling and unscheduling of baches – 13-02-2015

Area Location	Bach Number	Scheduled/Removed under EC 2003	Existing Use Rights Certificate 2011	Geotechnical Hazard Assessment – October 2014	Coastal Hazard Assessments on Storm Inundation (100yr scale event, 1m sea level rise) and Coastal Erosion (100yr landward extent of coastal erosion, 1m sea level rise) - November 2014	Located within public road	Impedes public access – based on McMillian assessment 04-02-2015	Option 2 (Uphold EC position except for baches to be unscheduled if a major geotechnical hazard is present)	Option 3 (Schedule those baches that do not impede public access and no major hazards present)
Taylor's Mistake	28	Removed	Yes	On top of small cliff but judged not a risk from cliff collapse. No boulder roll hazard event.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remove/unscheduled TM28	Change from removal to retain TM28
Taylor's Mistake	30	Removed	Yes	Hazard is from collapse of low cliff adjacent to the bach that would impact on site and could impact dwelling. Low rockfall hazard.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	Not reassessed	Remove/unscheduled due to geotechnical hazards TM30	Remove/unscheduled TM30
Taylor's Mistake	31	Removed	Yes	Direct hazard from rockfall, viable source of rocks in outcrops above the bach.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	Not reassessed	Remove/unscheduled due to geotechnical hazards TM31	Remove/unscheduled TM31
Taylor's Mistake	32	Removed	Yes	Direct hazard from rockfall, viable source of rocks in outcrops above the bach.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	Not reassessed	Remove/unscheduled due to geotechnical hazards TM32	Remove/unscheduled TM32
Taylor's Mistake	33	Removed	Yes	Distance from minor areas of rock outcrop indicate limited hazard from rockfall. No major hazard present.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remove/unscheduled TM33	Change from removal to retain TM33
Taylor's Mistake	34	Scheduled		Whilst a number of boulders have reached the flat area behind the bach during or before the earthquakes deemed to be a low hazard from rockfall.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM34	Remain/schedule TM34
Taylor's Mistake	35	Scheduled		Whilst a number of boulders have reached the flat area behind the bach during or before the earthquakes deemed to be a low hazard from rockfall.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM35	Remain/schedule TM35
Taylor's Mistake	36	Scheduled		Whilst a number of boulders have reached the flat area behind the bach during or before the earthquakes deemed to be a low hazard from rockfall.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM36	Remain/schedule TM36
Taylor's Mistake	37	Scheduled		Whilst a number of boulders have reached the flat area behind the bach during or before the earthquakes deemed to be a low hazard from rockfall.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM37	Remain/schedule TM37

Taylor's Mistake	38	Scheduled		Whilst a number of boulders have reached the flat area behind the bach during or before the earthquakes deemed to be a low hazard from rockfall.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM38	Remain/schedule TM38
Taylor's Mistake	39	Scheduled		Whilst a number of boulders have reached the flat area behind the bach during or before the earthquakes deemed to be a low hazard from rockfall.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM39	Remain/schedule TM39
Taylor's Mistake	40	Scheduled		Whilst a number of boulders have reached the flat area behind the bach during or before the earthquakes deemed to be a low hazard from rockfall.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM40	Remain/schedule TM40
Taylor's Mistake	41	Scheduled		Whilst a number of boulders have reached the flat area behind the bach during or before the earthquakes deemed to be a minor hazard from rockfall.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM41	Remain/schedule TM41
Taylor's Mistake	42	Scheduled		Whilst a number of boulders have reached the flat area behind the bach during or before the earthquakes deemed to be a low hazard from rockfall.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM42	Remain/schedule TM42
Taylor's Mistake	43	Scheduled		Whilst a number of boulders have reached the flat area behind the bach during or before the earthquakes deemed to be a low hazard from rockfall.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM43	Remain/schedule TM43
Taylor's Mistake	44	Scheduled		Outside hazard area.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM44	Remain/schedule TM44
Taylor's Mistake	45	Scheduled		Outside hazard area.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM45	Remain/schedule TM45
Taylor's Mistake	46	Scheduled		Outside hazard area.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remain/schedule TM46	Remain/schedule TM46

Taylor's Mistake	47	Removed	Yes	Outside hazard area.	On the very edge of the storm inundation area – requires further analysis of the risk.	Yes	No	Remove/unscheduled TM47	Change from removal to retain TM47
Taylor's Mistake	48	Removed	Yes	Outside hazard area.	Only small area (corner of the building) is located within the coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remove/unscheduled TM48	Change from removal to retain TM48
Taylor's Mistake	49	Removed	Yes	Outside hazard area.	Only small area (frontage of the building) is located within the coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remove/unscheduled TM49	Change from removal to retain TM49
Taylor's Mistake	51	Removed	Yes	Outside hazard area.	Located within the coastal erosion area, however the hazard is not a life-safety risk, the potential impacts may only occur in the very long term, and the proposed rules will ensure if and when the bach is affected and uninhabitable no replacement bach can be built.	Yes	No	Remove/unscheduled TM51	Change from removal to retain TM51
Taylor's Mistake	52	Removed	Yes	Outside hazard area.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remove/unscheduled TM52	Change from removal to retain TM52
Taylor's Hobsons Point	55	Removed	Yes	Outside hazard area.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remove/unscheduled TM55	Change from removal to retain TH55
Taylor's Hobsons Point	56	Removed	Yes	Outside hazard area.	Only slightly within the coastal erosion area.	Yes	Partially impedes public access but Council signage can address issue.	Remove/unscheduled TM56	Change from removal to retain TH56
Taylor's Hobsons Point	57	Removed	Yes	Outside hazard area.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remove/unscheduled TM57	Change from removal to retain TH57
Taylor's Hobsons Point	58	Removed	Yes	Outside hazard area.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	No	Remove/unscheduled TM58	Change from removal to retain TH58
Hobson's Bay	59	Scheduled		No significant current hazard.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Remain/schedule HB59	Remain/schedule HB59

Hobson's Bay	60	Scheduled		No hazard from cliff collapse inundation. Failure has affected slope below bach but does not undermine the structure. Further undermining could affect stability of structure but could be remediated.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes	May be considered to impede public access	Remove/unscheduled HB60	Remove/unscheduled HB60
Hobson's Bay	62	Scheduled		Building is located under a cliff which shows evidence of instability. Direct hazard from cliff collapse. Some stabilisation work has been undertaken but its effectiveness in future events is uncertain.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Remove/unscheduled HB62	Remove/unscheduled HB62
Hobson's Bay	63	Scheduled		Bach immediately under overhanging cliff which shows signs of instability. Direct hazard from cliff collapse.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Remove/unscheduled HB63	Remove/unscheduled HB63
Hobson's Bay	64	Scheduled		Bach immediately under overhanging cliff which shows signs of instability. Direct hazard from cliff collapse.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Remove/unscheduled HB64	Remove/unscheduled HB64
Hobson's Bay	67	Scheduled		Bach immediately under overhanging cliff which shows signs of instability. Direct hazard from cliff collapse.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Remove/unscheduled HB67	Remove/unscheduled HB67
Hobson's Bay	68	Scheduled		Bach immediately under overhanging cliff which shows signs of instability. Direct hazard from cliff collapse.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Remove/unscheduled HB68	Remove/unscheduled HB68
Hobson's Bay	69	Scheduled		Not at risk from cliff collapse or rockfall but is located in the mouth of a steep gully which may be susceptible to mass movement. No current known hazard.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Retain/schedule HB69	Retain/schedule HB69
Hobson's Bay	70	Scheduled		Outside hazard area.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Retain/schedule HB70	Retain/schedule HB70
Boulder Bay	1	Scheduled		Location judged a very high hazard area for debris avalanche and/or individual boulders.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Awaiting survey		Remove/unscheduled BB1	Remove/unscheduled BB1
Boulder Bay	2	Scheduled		Location judged a very high hazard area for debris avalanche and/or individual boulders.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Awaiting survey		Remove/unscheduled BB2	Remove/unscheduled BB2

Boulder Bay	4	Scheduled		Damaged rock in small cliff behind bach indicates a cliff collapse hazard	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Remove/unscheduled BB4	Remove/unscheduled BB4
Boulder Bay	5	Scheduled		Outside hazard area.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Retain/schedule BB5	Retain/schedule BB5
Boulder Bay	6	Scheduled		Outside hazard area.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Retain/schedule BB6	Retain/schedule BB6
Boulder Bay	7	Scheduled		Outside hazard area.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Retain/schedule BB7	Retain/schedule BB7
Boulder Bay	8	Scheduled		Small cliff behind baches may shed isolated boulders. Not deemed a cliff collapse hazard but moderate hazard from rockfall.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Remove/unscheduled BB8	Remove/unscheduled BB8
Boulder Bay	9	Scheduled		Small cliff behind baches may shed isolated boulders. Not deemed a cliff collapse hazard but moderate hazard from rockfall.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Remove/unscheduled BB9	Remove/unscheduled BB9
Boulder Bay	10	Scheduled		Direct risk from cliff collapse.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Remove/unscheduled BB10	Remove/unscheduled BB10
Boulder Bay	10A	Scheduled		Bach has been relocated to Godley Head.	Not located within storm inundation nor coastal erosion area.	Yes		Retain/schedule BB10A	Retain/schedule BB10A
Maori Gardens	1 – A	Not considered		High hazard site under steep slope	To be confirmed	Yes		N/A	Remove MG1
Maori Gardens	2 – B	Not considered		High hazard site under steep slope	To be confirmed	Yes		N/A	Remove MG2
Maori Gardens	3 – C	Not considered		High hazard site under steep slope	To be confirmed	Yes		N/A	Remove MG3
Maori Gardens	4 – D	Not considered		High hazard site under steep slope	To be confirmed	Yes		N/A	Remove MG4

Summary of options (excluding Maori Gardens)

	Option 1 EC Decision	Option 2	Option 3	Option 3 baches being reconsidered from removal to retention
Baches to remain	32	20	31	11
Baches to be removed	14	26	15	